RESEARCH REPORTS

Positive Affectivity and Negative Outcomes: The Role of Tenure and Job Satisfaction

Michelle K. Duffy
University of Kentucky

Jason D. Shaw
Drexel University

Daniel C. Ganster
University of Arkansas

In this study, the authors proposed and tested a 3-way interaction among positive affectivity (PA), job satisfaction, and tenure in predicting negative employee outcomes. Specifically, the authors predicted that the relationship between job satisfaction and negative outcomes would be stronger for high PAs and that this relationship would be more pronounced for longer tenured employees. Results support this 3-way interaction in predicting job search behavior, physical health complaints, and counterproductive employee behavior. In particular, the relationship between job satisfaction and negative outcomes was most strongly negative for high-PA individuals with longer tenure. The authors discuss the implications of these results and some directions for future research.

Background and Predictions

PA is a dimension of affective structure that can be characterized as the extent to which a person feels enthusiastic, active, and alert (Watson et al., 1988). Watson et al. described a person high in PA as being excited, joyful, enthusiastic, and exhilarated; whereas someone low in PA is characterized by listlessness and apathy (Cropanzano et al., 1993). High PA describes people who are generally more satisfied and who report the occurrence of pleasant events more frequently (Watson et al., 1988). Those who
are low in PA are not necessarily negative but rather are less likely to report positive feelings.

One area in which PA has received some attention concerns the relationship between trait PA and job satisfaction (see Judge, 1992). In addition to research examining the role of PA in predicting job attitudes such as satisfaction, some studies have started to explore the interaction between trait PA and job satisfaction in predicting other organizational outcomes. For example, Judge (1993) hypothesized that disposition and job satisfaction interact to predict actual turnover behavior. On the basis of Weitz's (1952) argument that the relationship between job satisfaction and voluntary turnover would be stronger if an individual's disposition was taken into account, Judge (1993) predicted that individuals with a positive disposition would be more likely to leave when they were dissatisfied with their jobs. Several theoretical positions support this prediction. First, Mobley (1977) argued that job dissatisfaction is translated into thoughts of quitting when there is an expectation that quitting will eventually result in a more satisfying job. Those high in PA are more likely to seek ways to proactively change their situation into a satisfying one. Those low in PA are lethargic and listless and may have no such proactive expectation (i.e., the dissatisfying job is just another annoyance in an already dissatisfying world). Interestingly, some studies have found that reactions to the work environment are likely to be much more intense for those high in PA than for those low in PA (Larsen & Ketelaar, 1991). Individuals with high PA are prone to experience more exhilaration and excitement in good or equitable situations (e.g., high pay raise), whereas those low in PA are likely to be happy in positive situations but are unlikely to experience the great heights common among individuals with high PA. Similarly, individuals with high PA may be prone to become tense in unfavorable situations and, in fact, may have an equally intense response to unfavorable events as to positive events. Conversely, individuals with low PA are predicted to respond to unfavorable situations with listlessness and apathy (Cropanzano et al., 1993).

Second, Judge (1993) suggests that factoring in an individual's disposition permits a more accurate assessment of the true job dissatisfaction of the individual relative to other things in life; that is, an individual high in PA who reports the same amount of job dissatisfaction as someone less positively inclined is actually experiencing a stronger dissatisfaction. Thus, by accounting for a person's baseline PA, one obtains a more accurate measurement of the relative degree of job satisfaction and may improve the prediction of other outcomes. Judge's (1993) data, in fact, supported the prediction that job satisfaction and affective disposition interact in predicting turnover.

The Role of Tenure

That tenure is a critical variable in research on individual affectivity is well established (e.g., Cropanzano et al., 1983; Helmreich, Sawin, & Carsrud, 1986). It is our position that the interaction of dispositional affectivity and job satisfaction provides only a partial explanation of employee attitudes and behaviors. A more complete picture of the role of individual affectivity in organizations is one that factors in dispositional, job attitudes, and situational variables (e.g., tenure).

Following Judge's (1993) arguments that low job satisfaction is strongly related to turnover (i.e., it is more discrepant) for those high in PA, it logically follows that this discrepancy would be particularly pronounced for those individuals who have been in their positions for a long time. Leaving one's dissatisfying job is often a more difficult and complicated endeavor that it would appear to be. Alternative employment availability and family concerns, for example, are constraints that weaken the relationship between attitudes and behavior (e.g., Johns, 1991). Moreover, high-tenure individuals may have accumulated more side bets, sunk costs, or investments with the organization (Becker, 1960; Meyer & Allen, 1984), making it difficult to leave regardless of job attitudes.¹ It is our position, then, that being unable or unwilling to leave a dissatisfying situation is likely to be more difficult and frustrating for individuals with high PA, bent on proactive change and uncomfortable with dissonance, than for those who are apathetic and listless with low PA.

A natural extension, then, is to consider whether dispositions simultaneously interact with job attitudes (such as job satisfaction), as well as with job situations (such as job tenure), in predicting outcomes. Previous research has generally taken a simpler approach to the role PA plays in organizational outcomes by examining main effects or two-way interactions. In the present study, we suggest that the interaction between PA and job satisfaction may result in divergent complex behavioral patterns depending on the individual's tenure with the organization.

The Present Study

Several authors have suggested that individuals with high PA are likely to regularly experience strong positive emotions such as exhilaration (Cropanzano et al., 1993). Moreover, a dissatisfying job could be more discrepant for these individuals (Judge, 1993). Research also suggests that individuals with high PA seek to proactively change their situation in dissonance-creating situations (Judge, 1993) and view discrepant affect–job attitude sit-

¹ We thank an anonymous reviewer for this suggestion.
utions as particularly frustrating. Moreover, the combinations of job dissatisfaction and high levels of PA should be more pronounced for longer tenured employees, hence our focus on organizational tenure as a key third variable.

Individuals with low PA, on the other hand, are characterized by apathy and listlessness and thus are less likely to perceive this discrepancy in a manner that would result in taking action or diminished well-being. At high-tenure levels, however, the dissonance-creating combination of high PA and undesirable job attributes (e.g., lack of job security, lack of satisfaction with pay) will take on greater importance for longer tenured employees. In particular, we examine interactive relationships among trait PA, job satisfaction, and job tenure in predicting job dissatisfaction and high levels of PA should be stronger the longer the individual had been in the organization. Longer tenured high-PA employees may be caught in a vicious cycle that diminishes physical health over time. This hypothesis is consistent with previous findings that work frustration was associated with physical health symptoms (Keenan & Newton, 1984; Spector, 1997).

Seeking a New Job

Frustration and dissonance on the job have been shown to be related to intention to quit and job search behaviors (Doran, Stone, Brief, & George, 1991; Spector, 1997) and actual turnover behavior (O'Connor, Peters, Pooyan, Weekley, Frank, & Erenkrantz, 1984). Thus, for individuals with high PA, we expected the relationship between job satisfaction and seeking a new job to be more strongly negative for high-tenure individuals than for low-tenure individuals. The dynamics were expected to be quite different for low-PA employees. The constitutive definition of low PA suggests that these individuals do not react as strongly to either job satisfaction or job dissatisfaction as do individuals with high PA. Thus, although individuals with low PA would be more apt to seek a new job when they were dissatisfied with their jobs than when satisfied, their reactions to such situations may not be as potent as the reactions of their high-PA counterparts (Cropanzano et al., 1993). Additionally, individuals with low PA, described as apathetic and listless, are less likely to intensify their search for alternative employment as their tenure with the organization increases.

This derivation led us to expect a three-way interaction among PA, job satisfaction, and tenure in predicting job search behaviors. Those high in PA who were dissatisfied with their jobs were expected to be the most likely to try to actively change their situation in discrepant situations (Judge, 1993). However, we expected this relationship to be stronger the longer the individual had been in the organization. Longer tenured high-PA employees may strongly intensify their search for alternative employment in an attempt to reduce the dissonance of a positive disposition and a dissatisfying job.

Physical Health Complaints

The three-way interaction among PA, job satisfaction, and tenure is also expected to be related to physical health outcomes. The main effects of dispositional factors and health outcomes have been well documented in the case of NA (Schaubroeck & Ganster, 1991). For PA, however, researchers have not consistently reported significant main effects with physical complaints (e.g., Jenkins, 1971; Paffnburger, Wolfe, & Notkin, 1966; Smith, Follick, & Korr, 1984). However, individuals high in PA who are dissatisfied with their jobs may experience deleterious health outcomes if they are unable to positively change their situation, whether it be for economic, social, or family reasons. High-tenure individuals may have accumulated more side bets, sunk costs, or investments with the organization (Becker, 1960; Meyer & Allen, 1984). Being unable then to leave the situation is likely to be more stressful for individuals with high PA than for apathetic and listless individuals with low PA. Thus, dissatisfied, long-tenured, and high-PA individuals may be caught in a vicious cycle that diminishes physical health over time. This hypothesis is consistent with previous findings that work frustration was associated with physical health symptoms (Keenan & Newton, 1984; Spector, 1997).

Counterproductive Work Behaviors

Counterproductive organizational behaviors are also predicted to be influenced by the interaction of PA, job satisfaction, and tenure. Examples of counterproductive behaviors include intentionally working in a slow manner, working sloppily, and engaging in unsafe workplace behaviors. Several studies have provided a direct positive linkage between frustration and counterproductive behaviors (e.g., Geddes, 1994; Spector, 1987) and a negative relationship between job satisfaction and counterproductive behaviors (e.g., Berte, Moretti, Jusko, & Leonard, 1981; Hollinger & Clark, 1983; Kamp & Brooks, 1991). Continuing our theme, the relationship between job satisfaction and counterproductive behaviors is expected to be most strongly negative for longer tenured high-PA individuals.

Method

Participants and Procedure

Data were collected from full-time employees of the fire and police departments of a medium-sized midwestern city in the United States. These participants were recruited at their worksites to participate in a study of quality of worklife. Top-level administrators in each agency endorsed the study and allowed the researchers to survey their employees at the worksite. Although the administration endorsed the study, respondents were
assured of the complete confidentiality of their data. Completed questionnaires were mailed directly to the researchers.

As an incentive to participate, we notified respondents that $5 would be donated on their behalf to either Santa Cops Charities or the Muscular Dystrophy Foundation for every completed questionnaire. Overall, complete surveys were returned by 181 employees, which represents 68% of the employees contacted. Participants’ ages ranged from 29 to 62 years, with a mean age of 40 years. Eighty-nine percent of the participants were male.

**Independent Variables**

We assessed trait PA with the Extraversion scale of H. J. Eysenck and S. B. G. Eysenck (1968). The Eysenck and Eysenck Personality Inventory is listed as a valid measure of affectivity by Watson, Pennebaker, and Folger (1987), and previous research has used the Extraversion scale as a measure of PA (e.g., Schaubroeck, Ganster, & Kemmerer, 1996). The scale consists of 24 items in which the respondent is asked whether various statements are true or false as they apply to the respondent personally (coded 0 = false, 1 = true). Actual scores ranged from 1 to 23. Negatively worded items were recoded such that agreement with the statements indicates high PA. The reliability of this scale was .77.

We used the Job Diagnostic Survey developed by Hackman and Oldman (1975) to measure overall job satisfaction. The scale had 17 items with seven response options (coded 1–7) assessing security, pay, workload, growth, and supervisory and coworker satisfaction. The mean of the 17 items formed the overall job satisfaction measure. The internal reliability of the scale in the current study was .91.

We assessed tenure by asking respondents to indicate how many years they had been in their current position. Tenure levels ranged from 1 to 35 years.

**Dependent Variables**

We assessed physical health complaints with a scale adapted from House (1981). This scale has been validated against related medical diagnoses for angina, respiratory problems, ulcer, and symptoms of indigestion—physical problems most frequently associated with stress (Kemmerer, 1990). This scale sums 11 items indicating conditions such as angina, high blood pressure, gastric symptoms (e.g., ulcers, indigestion), and respiratory problems (e.g., cough, phlegm). Each item was coded 1 if the physical problem was present and 0 if the physical problem was absent. Actual scores ranged from 0 to 8.

We assessed counterproductive work behavior with six items with seven response options (coded 1–7) that measured the extent to which employees engaged in behaviors not conducive to effective individual and organizational performance. The mean of the items forms the measure. Two sample items are “I keep important information away from my boss,” and “I openly compromise with others but delay implementing the compromise until my own objectives are accomplished.” The alpha for this scale was .71.

We measured seeking a new job on a one-item scale with seven response options (coded 1–7) in which respondents reported the extent to which they were actively seeking a new job.

We included two demographic variables, age and gender, in this study as control variables.

**Analysis Strategy**

We used hierarchical multiple regression to test the hypotheses according to the procedure delineated by Cohen and Cohen (1983). The significance of each three-way interaction was assessed after controlling for all main effects as well as two-way interactions between the independent variables. Age and gender were entered first, followed by positive affect, job satisfaction, and tenure in the second block; the two-way interactions in the third step; and finally the three-way interaction. We also tested the quadratic components for significance as suggested by Edwards (1994), but none of the terms were significant and were subsequently dropped from the analyses. We examined changes in $R^2$ and standardized regression coefficients for each variable.

**Results**

Table 1 presents the descriptive statistics and the correlations among the study variables. As can be seen in Table 1, job satisfaction was significantly and negatively related to incumbent reports of counterproductive work behavior and seeking a new job. Trait PA, however, did not correlate significantly with any of the dependent variables. Consistent with previous research, PA was related to job satisfaction ($r = .15, p < .05$) but was not related to tenure ($r = -.09, ns$).

The results of the regression analyses are presented in Tables 2–4. As can be seen from these tables, we found significant three-way interactions in each equation, thus supporting our hypotheses. Figures 1–3 display plots of the three-way interaction between trait PA, job satisfaction, and tenure in predicting the respective outcome variables. For each interaction, two separate plots split by tenure levels present the two-way interactions. We used values representing plus and minus one standard deviation from the mean to split the graphs and to generate the plotted regression lines (Cohen & Cohen, 1983).

Figure 1 presents the three-way interaction between job satisfaction, trait PA, and tenure in predicting seeking a new job. An examination of these graphs reveals several interesting findings. First, the interaction between PA and job satisfaction in predicting seeking a new job differed depending on how long employees have been in their present jobs. For relatively low-tenure employees, as job satisfaction increased job search behaviors decreased for employees with both high and low PA. However, this relationship was significantly less pronounced for individuals with high PA. Finally, employees with the highest level of job search behavior were those who are both low in PA and in job satisfaction.
Table 1
Descriptive Statistics and Correlations Among All Study Variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>M</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Age</td>
<td>40.54</td>
<td>7.53</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Gender</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td></td>
<td>.24*</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Positive affectivity</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>—0.09</td>
<td>.05</td>
<td>(.79)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Job satisfaction</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>—10</td>
<td>—15**</td>
<td>(.91)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Tenure</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>.48**</td>
<td>—0.09</td>
<td>—17*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dependent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Seeking a new job</td>
<td>2.49</td>
<td>1.43</td>
<td>.14</td>
<td>.12</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>—.48**</td>
<td>.07</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Counterproductive work behavior</td>
<td>3.20</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>—10</td>
<td>.13</td>
<td>.11</td>
<td>—.24*</td>
<td>.08</td>
<td>.23**</td>
<td>.05</td>
<td>(.71)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. N = 181. Coefficient alpha reliabilities are reported in parentheses on the main diagonal where appropriate. Gender coded as male = 1 and female = 2.

*p < .05. **p < .01.

An examination of the high-tenure plot reveals a different pattern of results than that described in the low-tenure plot. In particular, it is interesting to note that the employees who report the highest job search behaviors are those who are high in trait PA and low in job satisfaction. For high-tenure employees, it did not appear that PA was able to mitigate any of the deleterious influences of low job satisfaction on job search behavior. In fact, just the opposite occurred: The higher individuals were in PA, the more likely they were to search for a new job to replace their dissatisfying job.

Figure 2 displays the three-way interaction between job satisfaction, trait PA, and tenure in predicting physical health problems. As can be seen from the graphs, the interaction between PA and job satisfaction in predicting health problems differed depending on the length of tenure. For individuals who had not been in their present jobs for long periods of time (low tenure), high trait PA appeared to be able to mitigate part of the negative relationship between job dissatisfaction and health problems. Overall, health symptoms appeared lower for individuals higher in PA, regardless of their satisfaction with the job. The highest level of health complaints is found in individuals who are simultaneously low in PA and job satisfaction.

In cases of higher tenure, the greatest level of health complaints was reported by those individuals who were simultaneously high in PA and low in job satisfaction, thus supporting our hypothesis. For individuals who had been in their present jobs for a long period of time, PA appeared to exacerbate health problems.

Last, Figure 3 reveals a similar pattern with respect to employees' counterproductive work behaviors. Examining the low-tenure plot, we found that the relationship jobs for long periods of time (low tenure), high trait PA appeared to be able to mitigate part of the negative relationship between job dissatisfaction and health problems. Overall, health symptoms appeared lower for individuals higher in PA, regardless of their satisfaction with the job. The highest level of health complaints is found in individuals who are simultaneously low in PA and job satisfaction.

In cases of higher tenure, the greatest level of health complaints was reported by those individuals who were simultaneously high in PA and low in job satisfaction, thus supporting our hypothesis. For individuals who had been in their present jobs for a long period of time, PA appeared to exacerbate health problems.

Table 2
Hierarchical Regression Results With Seeking a New Job as the Dependent Variable

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Block</th>
<th>$R_{model}$</th>
<th>$\Delta R_{model}$</th>
<th>$\beta$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control variables</td>
<td>.02</td>
<td>.02</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent variables</td>
<td>.23**</td>
<td>.21**</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive affectivity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.48**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two-way interactions</td>
<td>.24**</td>
<td>.01</td>
<td>0.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Satisfaction $\times$ Positive Affectivity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Satisfaction $\times$ Tenure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive Affectivity $\times$ Tenure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three-way interaction</td>
<td>.27**</td>
<td>.03*</td>
<td>-0.19*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job Satisfaction $\times$ Positive Affectivity $\times$ Tenure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. N = 181.

*p < .05. **p < .01.
between job dissatisfaction and employee behaviors appeared to be roughly equal for employees with high trait PA and those with low trait PA. When tenure was low, individuals with low PA reported slightly higher levels of counterproductive work behavior than individuals with high PA did, but the relationship between job satisfaction and counterproductive work behavior was slightly negative for individuals with low and high PA. The high-tenure graph suggests that employees with high PA and low job satisfaction were more likely to engage in counterproductive work behaviors. Indeed, the high-tenure plot shows that the relationship between job satisfaction and counterproductive work behavior was strongly negative for individuals with high PA. In comparison to employees with high PA, those with low PA exhibited lower levels of counterproductive behavior when they were dissatisfied with their jobs, once again supporting our prediction.

### Discussion

These findings suggest that interaction between job satisfaction and PA operates in a different manner contingent on the length of time an employee has worked at a job. At higher tenure levels, individuals with high PA appear to become increasingly frustrated with dissatisfying jobs and begin to exhibit a variety of frustration-induced behaviors and symptoms. To the extent that a person with high PA is able to change his or her situation (e.g., by finding a new job), this frustration may lead to positive and proactive behaviors such as asking for a pay increase, or redefining aspects of the job. Individuals who feel trapped or unable to escape a job situation they find distasteful may begin to manifest physical problems and act out at work by no longer performing at their level of capability or by deliberately sabotaging work. These find-
Figure 1. Three-way interaction among positive affectivity, job satisfaction, and tenure predicting seeking a new job. PA = positive affectivity.

Figure 2. Three-way interaction among positive affectivity, job satisfaction, and tenure predicting physical health complaints. PA = positive affectivity.
Figure 3. Three-way interaction among positive affectivity, job satisfaction, and tenure predicting counterproductive work behaviors. PA = positive affectivity.
individuals with low PA. An interesting area for future research would be to explore in detail, over time, the differing dynamics for individuals with both high and low PA.

The results of this study suggest a complex role for affective traits in organizational settings. This role is not one that denies the influence of situational variables in determining attitudes and behaviors, rather it asserts that traits can help determine how an individual's attitudes become implicated in behaviors and even physical well being. An underlying assumption of our model is that people with different affective dispositions will develop different expectations or will make different attributions about their jobs. These ideas suggest several interesting areas for future research. First, our theoretical position suggests that affect—attitude mismatches create dissonance or frustration over time. Of course, we did not measure these variables directly; instead, we noted that the hypothesized pattern appears with more distal outcomes. Although our contention is such, it is certainly important for future research to tease apart the more proximal reactions of individuals with high and low PA to different work environments. While this study was a first step in investigating how and why affectivity plays a role in organizational life, future research that directly addresses the dissonance and frustration issues would be a beneficial next step. Second, in deriving our hypotheses we suggested that some underlying factors (e.g., sunk costs or side bets) may be partially responsible for some of the relationships observed in this study. It is possible, of course, that some constraining factors (e.g., a tight job market) may be more deleterious to health and organizational behaviors than others (e.g., dual-career issues or geographic preferences). Third, research should investigate other behavioral differences between high and low PAs. For example, high PAs are thought to be more likely to attempt to change their situation when dissatisfied. Thus, future researchers might examine alternative behavioral outcomes, such as union activism, in addition to job search intentions and turnover. Finally, our model provides a rationale for including trait affectivity constructs in the socialization and newcomer adjustment literature and indeed might help explain why there is so much individual variability in the early adjustment process. An interesting and important avenue for future research would be to measure and attempt to disentangle some of these relationships.

References

Johns, G. (1991). Substantive and methodological constraints on behavior and attitudes in organizational research. Organiz-
RESEARCH REPORTS

zational Behavior and Human Decision Processes, 49, 80–104.


Received June 6, 1997
Revision received April 22, 1998
Accepted April 22, 1998